

**MINUTES OF THE COUNCIL
HELD ON**

23 February 2023

7.30 - 9.38 pm

PRESENT

COUNCILLORS

Andrew Johnson (Chair)
Sue Livings (Vice-Chair)

Simon Carter	Colleen Morrison
Joel Charles	Kay Morrison
Jean Clark	Russell Perrin
Jodi Dunne	Daniella Pritchard
Tony Durcan	Nicky Purse
Tony Edwards	Matthew Saggars
Michael Garnett	Stacy Seales
James Griggs	Lanie Shears
Alastair Gunn	Clive Souter
Michael Hardware	Dan Swords
James Leppard	Chris Vince
Ash Malik	Mark Wilkinson

OFFICERS

Andrew Bramidge, Chief Executive
Simon Freeman, Deputy Chief Executive and Director of Finance
Simon Hill, Director of Governance and Corporate Services
Hannah Marriott, Governance Support Officer

78. **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors David Carter, Nick Churchill, Bob Davis, Eddie Johnson, Steve LeMay, John Strachan and Nancy Watson.

79. **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

None.

80. **MINUTES**

RESOLVED that the minutes of the meeting held on 15 December 2022 are agreed as a correct record and signed by the Chair.

81. **COMMUNICATIONS FROM THE CHAIR**

The Chair noted that was LGBTQ+ History Month and gave a reflection on this.

The Council also paid tribute to two former Councillors, Doug Pennick and Paul Bellairs, who had recently passed away.

82. **PETITIONS FROM THE PUBLIC**

None.

83. **QUESTIONS FROM THE PUBLIC**

The questions, together with the answers, are appended to the minutes.

84. **QUESTIONS FROM COUNCILLORS**

The questions, together with the answers, are appended to the minutes.

85. **MOTIONS FROM COUNCILLORS**

a) Debate: Not Hate

Proposed by Councillor Kay Morrison (seconded by Councillor Lanie Shears):

“To be elected is a privilege and a responsibility. Unfortunately, increasing levels of abuse and intimidation have had a negative impact on politicians and democracy at local and national levels. Disagreement and constructive challenge are healthy: the sort of abuse that's intended to silence the democratic voice and to deter people from entering politics at any level is not.

I call upon Harlow Council to:

1. Address the impacts of abuse on councillors' mental health;
2. Work with LGA to raise awareness of available options and good practice;
3. Remind councillors of the Code of Conduct to ensure that their behaviour to each other and to staff members is respectful and courteous;
4. Ensure that councillors and officers are aware of available support and that they are encouraged to request support when needed, without stigma.”

RESOLVED that the motion was agreed.

86. **REFERENCES FROM CABINET AND COMMITTEES**

The Chair asked Full Council to take items 9a-f of the agenda together and this was agreed. As required by the Local Authorities (Standing Orders) (England) (Amendment) Regulations 2014 all votes on these agenda items were recorded. Details of these are appended to the minutes.

- a) Referral from Cabinet - Medium Term Financial Strategy
2023/24 - 2025/26

Cabinet recommended to Full Council that:

- A** The General Fund element of Medium Term Financial Strategy for 2023/24 to 2025/26 (attached as appendix B to the report) is adopted.
- B** The Housing Revenue Account (HRA) element of the Medium Term Financial Strategy for 2023/24 to 2025/26 (as attached as Appendix C to the report) is adopted.
- C** The planned Council Tax freeze for 2023/24 for the Harlow Council element of the 2023/24 Council Tax demand is approved.
- D** That the anticipated New Homes Bonus for 2023/24 of £572,205 be used to increase the funds available within the Budget Stabilisation Reserve to a projected balance of £1.35million when combined with other proposals set out in this and the General Fund Budget report.
- E** That movements in reserves set out in the report are approved.

Proposed by Councillor Russell Perrin (seconded by Councillor James Leppard) it was:

RESOLVED that the above recommendations be approved.

- b) Referral from Cabinet - General Fund Budget 2023/24

Cabinet recommended to Full Council that:

- A** The General Fund estimates for 2023/24, as set out in Appendix A to the report, are approved.
- B** The proposed transfers between the General Fund and Earmarked Reserves, referred to within the report and set out in Appendix C to the report, are approved.
- C** The proposed Fees and Charges, as set out in Appendix E to the report, are approved.
- D** The Pay Policy Statement, as set out in Appendix F to the report, is approved.
- E** The Council's Band D Council Tax for 2023/24 is set at £288.90 representing a 0% increase as set out in the 2023/24 MTFS.

Councillor Chris Vince (seconded by Councillor Tony Edwards) moved an amendment as set out in supplementary agenda 2.

A recorded vote was taken on the amendment and the amendment was lost.

Councillor Russell Perrin (seconded by Councillor Chris Vince) proposed an amendment to the substantive motion to agree to consider the financial implications of the proposed Labour Group amendments relating to support for free breakfast clubs and four neighbourhood committees.

A recorded vote was taken on the amendment and the amendment was carried. The amendment became the substantive motion.

Councillor Russell Perrin (seconded by Councillor James Leppard) moved that a vote was taken on the substantive motion. As required by law a recorded vote was taken and it was:

RESOLVED that the above recommendations be approved with the amendment that the Council consider the financial implications of the proposed Labour Group amendments.

- c) Referral from Cabinet - Housing Revenue Account Business Plan 2022-2052

Cabinet recommended to Full Council that:

- A** The Housing Revenue Account (HRA) Business Plan, as set out in Appendix A to this report, is approved.
- B** Authority is delegated to the Director of Housing, in consultation with the Portfolio Holder for Housing, to make minor amendments and finalisation of the Plan and Appendices, following consultation.

Proposed by Councillor Russell Perrin (seconded by Councillor James Leppard) it was:

RESOLVED that the above recommendations be approved.

- d) Referral from Cabinet - Housing Revenue Account Budget 2023/24

Cabinet recommended to Full Council that:

- A** Approve the Housing Revenue Account (HRA) estimates as set out in Appendix 1 to the report.

- B** Approve a working balance of £3.529 million for the HRA (set out in paragraph 23 of the report).
- C** Approve that tenant rents are increased by 7 percent with effect from 3 April 2023. This equates to an average weekly rent of £104.18 an increase of £6.82 (set out in paragraph 3 of the report).
- D** Approve that the rents and personal charges for temporary accommodation are increased with effect from 3 April 2022 as set out in paragraph 4 of the report.
- E** Approve that garage rents within the 'retain and invest' category are increased by 5 percent with effect from 1 April 2023. This equates to an average weekly rent of £12.35, an increase of £0.56. Also approve the proportionate increases for other garages, car ports and car spaces (set out in paragraph 5 of the report).
- F** Approve that tenant service charges are increased to recover full cost with effect from 3 April 2023 (see paragraphs 6 to 8 of the report and Appendix 2 attached to the report).
- G** Approve that other housing related support charges for sheltered accommodation are increased to recover full cost with effect from 3 April 2023 (see paragraphs 9 to 13 of the report and Appendix 2 attached to the report).
- H** Approve that the leasehold service charges are increased with effect from 1 April 2023 to ensure that all leaseholder costs are recovered (see paragraphs 16 to 19 of the report and Appendix 2 attached to the report).
- I** Approve that all other tenant charges are increased with effect from 3 April 2023 in order to recover cost (see Appendix 2 attached to the report).

Proposed by Councillor Russell Perrin (seconded by Councillor James Leppard) it was:

RESOLVED that the above recommendations be approved.

- e) Referral from Cabinet - Capital and Treasury Report 2023

Cabinet recommended to Full Council that:

- A** The following Capital and Treasury Reports be approved:
 - i) The Capital Strategy Report (Appendix A to the report).

- ii) The Treasury Management Strategy Statement 2023/24 (Appendix B to the report).
- iii) The Investment Strategy Report 2023/24 (Appendix C to the report).
- iv) The MRP Statement 2023/24 (Appendix D to the report).

Proposed by Councillor Russell Perrin (seconded by Councillor James Leppard) it was:

RESOLVED that the above recommendations be approved.

- f) Referral from Cabinet - Capital Programmes 2022/23 - 2024/25

Cabinet recommended to Full Council that it:

- A** Approve the 2023/24 Housing Capital Programme (HCP) totalling £38.891 million as set out in Appendix 1.
- B** Approve of the inclusion in the Housing Capital Programme of an additional £18 million over 3 years for a Housing “Catch up Stock Need” as set out in Table 2.
- C** Approve the updated New Build programme as set out in Table 3.
- D** Approve the 2023/24 Non-Housing Capital Programme totalling £13.471 million (attached as Appendix 2 to the report), noting the additional £2.789 million investment in response to Business Cases received as detailed in Table 11.

Proposed by Councillor Russell Perrin (seconded by Councillor James Leppard) it was:

RESOLVED that the above recommendations be approved.

87. **SUSPENSION OF STANDING ORDERS - COUNCIL PROCEDURE**
RULE 9.1 - LENGTH OF MEETING

With the consent of the meeting, it was agreed to suspend Council Procedure Rule 9.1 and that the meeting would continue until the remaining business had been considered.

88. **REPORTS FROM OFFICERS**

- a) Council Tax Resolution 2023/24

As required by the Local Authorities (Standing Orders) (England) (Amendment) Regulations 2014 the vote on this item was recorded. Details of this is appended to the minutes.

Proposed by Councillor Russell Perrin (seconded by Councillor James Leppard) it was:

RESOLVED that the Council Tax Resolution for 2023/24, as set out in Appendix A to the report, is approved.

89. **APPOINTMENTS TO COMMITTEES, SUB COMMITTEES AND PANELS OF THE COUNCIL**

Proposed by Councillor Russell Perrin (seconded by Councillor James Leppard) it was:

RESOLVED that the changes to Committees, Sub Committees and Panels of the Council appointments highlighted in bold be approved as appended to the minutes.

90. **APPOINTMENT OF MEMBER CHAMPIONS**

Proposed by Councillor Russell Perrin (seconded by Councillor James Leppard) it was:

RESOLVED that the changes to Member Champion appointments highlighted in bold be approved as appended to the minutes.

91. **APPOINTMENT OF COUNCIL REPRESENTATIVES ON OUTSIDE BODIES**

Proposed by Councillor Russell Perrin (seconded by Councillor James Leppard) it was:

RESOLVED that the changes to Council Representatives on Outside Bodies appointments highlighted in bold be approved as amended to the minutes.

92. **MINUTES OF CABINET AND COMMITTEE MEETINGS**

RESOLVED that the minutes of the following meetings are noted.

- a) Minutes of meeting Wednesday, 7 December 2022 of Development Management Committee
- b) Minutes of meeting Wednesday, 11 January 2023 of Development Management Committee

93. **MATTERS OF URGENT BUSINESS**

None.

CHAIR OF THE COUNCIL

Full Council – 23 February 2023

Questions from the Public

1 Mick Patrick to Councillor Stacy Seales (Portfolio Holder for Governance):

It has been brought to our attention that due to the ULEZ zones in London and the proposed extension of ULEZ zone. That Arriva buses and post office vehicles have been transferred to Harlow from London. So, we now have higher emission vehicles in Harlow. What has Harlow Council done to encourage the use of lower emission vehicle from our public services.

Reply from Councillor Stacy Seales (Portfolio Holder for Governance):

Road transport is one of the biggest contributors of nitrogen dioxide and particulate matter emissions. The London ULEZ is an example of how some authorities are tackling air pollution in a bid to improve public health. Unfortunately, as a result of low emission schemes in London, bus operators on commercial routes in Harlow and other towns outside of London are operating buses with higher polluting vehicles which are not the most up to date with regards to EURO standards.

Harlow Council is working with multiple stakeholders to encourage a modal shift within Harlow to use more sustainable forms of transport. Buses play an important part to this and so the Council and its partners are encouraging local bus operators and businesses to shift to lower/zero emitting vehicles.

As you may be aware, the Council is supporting the establishment of sustainable transport corridors (STC) in Harlow, with the development by Essex County Council of the Harlow North to Town Centre STC.

The Harlow Bus User Group was established to discuss bus services across the town. The meetings are open to the public and give the opportunity for the public to have their say on the bus network, including giving the opportunity for a wider discussion on the need to reduce air pollution emissions from the local bus operating network. The next meeting is currently being arranged and is expected to take place during April 2023.

2 Anthony Wiseman to Councillor Russell Perrin (Leader of the Council):

What plans has the council agreed with the Essex County Council for repairs to the pot holes in Harlow and are they planning to publish those plans via Your Harlow or the next quarterly leaflet distribution?

Reply from Councillor Russell Perrin (Leader of the Council):

As Mr Wiseman is no doubt aware Harlow Council has no legal responsibility to repair and maintain the vast majority of roads in Harlow, this is the legal responsibility of Essex County Council. However, whilst recognising that the deterioration of roads is a nationwide problem and not just isolated to Harlow or even Essex, my administration has been keen from the outset to raise the poor state of the roads here in Harlow with Essex County Council and to work with them to find solutions to speeding up and increasing the number of repairs to our roads.

I have been in discussions with the ECC cabinet member for highways over a good many months and we are close to agreeing a match funded scheme between our two authorities to increase the number of repairs to our roads. More details on this will be released to the media in due course.

Our County councillors, are in regular contact with their 'highway buddies' at Essex County Council to notify them of urgent works required to our roads.

An announcement by Essex County Council last week to increase the funding for pothole repairs by £9M will also have a positive impact on the rate of repair to our roads.

3 Anthony Wiseman to Councillor Russell Perrin (Leader of the Council):

Please explain what the additional cost per household would be, via Council Tax, if a special levy were to be used to raise the funds for pot hole repair. And could Harlow Council carry out those works if ECC will not?

Reply from Councillor Russell Perrin (Leader of the Council):

We have asked Essex County Council if they can provide us with the data that would enable us to make the calculation that would answer your question. If and when they are able to provide us with this data we would be happy to provide you with an answer in writing to your question.

It is not considered that a special levy can be sought for highway maintenance. It is understood that there are restrictions upon both who could seek a special levy and the purpose of any such proposed levy and that this request would fail on both aspects.

Supplementary question from Anthony Wiseman to Councillor Russell Perrin (Leader of the Council):

If people understood the costs, they might be a little bit more understanding of your situation.

Supplementary reply from Councillor Russell Perrin (Leader of the Council):

I thank Mr Wiseman and in the spirit in which the question was asked, it is certainly not my response to that helpful comment is not to offer excuses to the public but merely to inform them of the questions that our group are often asked as to the reasons why our roads are the way that they are. There are a number of things. Namely, Essex County Council oversee a road network that the size equivalent to Northern Ireland to put it into perspective number one. Number two, new towns, particularly ones like Harlow, many of the roads are built on a concrete sub-base which is moving and so our roads are more prone to deterioration to many other roads. Number three, we have had a summer of extreme heat and a winter of extreme cold and all of those that can remember their days of geography from school and the freeze thaw affect and expansion and contraction will know that the base in which the roads are sitting is shifting more and so, whilst at this time of year we are this time of year would experience more pot holes, we are experiencing even more than we would normally for those reasons based on the laws of physics. When the laws of physics come into contact with laws of the economy, we have problems and that's why we are grateful that Essex County Council have recognised the need to do more given those georpg and heat related problems and are investing more than £9 million to address that problem. Unfortunately, I suspect that pot holes and the problem of them will forever be with us because they are a physical thing and the roads are subject to mechanical wear but Essex County Council and us are determined to continue to work to speed up the rate of those repairs when they are necessary and that's what we will continue to do when we can so thank you for your question today.

4 David Forman to Councillor Nicky Purse (Portfolio Holder for Environment):

The cost of the premium green waste service was slashed by the last Labour administration from £96 to £42 on 28 February 2020. The then portfolio holder for Environment, the late Cllr Danny Purton, remarked in a press release: "...we recognise that many residents want the convenience of being able to recycle their garden waste from home. The cost has been too high for too long and we have listened and responded to our residents."

Does the portfolio holder for Environment consider the proposed above inflation increase of 14.29% for the green waste service - the largest percentage increase in the Analysis of Fees and Charges - mean that the Conservative administration has stopped listening to residents and failed to spread increased charges more evenly across the board?

Reply from Councillor Nicky Purse (Portfolio Holder for Environment):

A regular and reliable collection of green waste is a valuable service provided to Harlow residents, and is a service considered important for residents by me, the Portfolio Holder, as well as the wider administration.

There was no increase in the charge to residents last year for this service, despite there being a 7% increase in the charge made to Harlow Council for the provision of the service. It is anticipated that the price to the council will increase again with effect from 1 April, and this will be in line with the Consumer Price Index at that time. The increase proposed in the council's fees and charges for 23/24 is equivalent to an increase of 50p per month for household choosing to use the service, and this, in my opinion, remains good value for money for residents.

Supplementary Question from David Forman to Councillor Nicky Purse (Portfolio Holder for Environment):

Given that many pensioners use this service and the fact there are so many other charges that the Council kept to no increase at all, I'm just wondering what impact assessment was made of the increased charges to see whether or not they disproportionality affect any particular vulnerable group in our town? What assessment was made to the impact on vulnerable groups when this increase to charges was made?

Supplementary Reply from Councillor Nicky Purse (Portfolio Holder for Environment):

In terms of impact, I would have to get back to you to see. In terms of actually talking to residents, I have been out on many wards this week. The residents still believe that it is value for money and many of those being pensioners this week that I have been talking to. They still value the time and the pressures on their vehicle and the cost of petrol which outweighs it, in the sense that 50p is a good cost to have.

5 Colin Thorpe to Councillor Michael Hardware (Portfolio Holder for Regeneration and Strategic Growth):

At a recent residents meeting in my capacity of Chairman my attention was brought to the decline of bus services in Harlow in general but in particular the possible withdrawal of the number 9 which serves Potter Street which would leave some areas more isolated than they already are.

In light of plans for a new bus terminus how does the Council plan to address these issues?

Reply from Councillor Michael Hardware (Portfolio Holder for Regeneration and Strategic Growth):

The new Sustainable Transport Interchange represents a key step in the regeneration of our town centre, delivering a fit-for-purpose transport hub that delivers significantly improved facilities and public realm.

These improvements will provide a safe and welcoming environment for current users and will act as one of a wider grouping of catalysts to increase the adoption of sustainable transport modes by new passengers. It will be through this adoption that sustainable transport options and bus services will become an increasingly popular mode of choice.

The design of the Interchange has been developed in conjunction with Highways and Passenger Transport colleagues at Essex County Council, as well as wider stakeholders including the Bus Operators, to ensure the scheme delivers its intended outcomes.

With reference to the number 9 commercial bus service, we are aware it is due to be withdrawn by Arriva in April 2023. We understand the reason for this is due to lack of available drivers and the knock-on effect this has to services and profitability.

The Council is currently liaising with Essex County Council on the matter who have indicated they will be undertaking a sustainability study to understand whether they can directly support the service in the future. The timeframe of this study is currently being considered.

Supplementary question from Colin Thorpe to Councillor Michael Hardware (Portfolio Holder for Regeneration and Strategic Growth):

In regards to Councillor Hardware's answer, with reference to the last two paragraphs of the answer, the question that is asked is what are you going to do about it and your answer says you are going to be talking but there is no time scale. This bus is needed. It serves from New Hall picking up school children, through Potter Street, through Brays Grove school, right the way round so it's quite a large area that it serves. Are you aware of that?

Supplementary reply from Councillor Michael Hardware (Portfolio Holder for Regeneration and Strategic Growth):

Yes, I am fully aware of the implications but the responsibility for supporting bus services is at Essex County Council and I have no answers until they provide them to me.

6 Colin Thorpe to Councillor Joel Charles (Portfolio Holder for Community and Business Resilience):

In the light of recent crime both in the Stow and Prentice Place CCTV footage should have been available. I have been informed by one resident after the theft of a motor bike from Prentice Place that the police were awaiting release of CCTV footage from the Council.

In Prentice Place cameras are facing to the ground so giving no overall view. The question asked is does the CCTV work in both the Stow and Prentice Place?

Reply from Councillor Joel Charles (Portfolio Holder for Community and Business Resilience):

The Council is committed to tackling anti-social behaviour and crime. In the new Community Safety Strategy for the town, the Council is clear that CCTV provision is a tool to assist in the identification of perpetrators of crime and can help to increase the number of successful prosecutions through the criminal justice system.

I can confirm that all the CCTV cameras at The Stow are fully operational – officers have made sure to check this is the case. All council-run CCTV cameras are checked regularly as part of a routine maintenance cycle.

The installation of the CCTV at Prentice Place was intended to be a temporary solution to monitor the refurbishment works that took place as part of the regeneration programme in response to the vandalism that was taking place at the site whilst the works were ongoing. As part of the works, security doors were also installed to reassure residents that access to certain areas of Prentice Place would be managed. The CCTV system is not currently operational as its specific purpose was to act as a building site deterrent. However, housing officers and the property and facilities team are reviewing the CCTV provision at Prentice Place to determine what is the most proportionate solution to meet ongoing monitoring needs.

The Council continues to use CCTV because it is proven that it deters people from using certain areas for anti-social and criminal activities.

Supplementary question from Colin Thorpe to Councillor Joel Charles (Portfolio Holder for Community and Business Resilience):

I find the answer rather strange but there you go. As you may be aware there is a service charge levied on all the shops in Prentice Place and I know for a fact that when we were going to be renting Osler House as a Potter Street Health and Wellbeing hub, included in that service charge was a charge for

CCTV. I'm sure the shop holders would be very happy if they would find out that they are paying for something that isn't it.

Supplementary reply from Councillor Joel Charles (Portfolio Holder for Community and Business Resilience):

Mr Thorpe, I have some good news for you. Housing colleagues have looked at the different options as I said in my earlier response. The results of that and looking at the installation charge, the regular maintenance and servicing that would be incurred for such a device, I am pleased to say that on an operational basis housing officers have instructed the programme to proceed. What that means is that operationally housing officers where this sits because of the works that took place at Prentice Place will be round there in the coming weeks to instal a system. They have actively been engaging with a number of residents in your local area about the ongoing complaints. It's not just the vandalism that took place, it has been ongoing and we are going to get it sorted, so I'm pleased to tell you that Mr Thorpe.

Full Council – 23 February 2023

Questions from Councillors

1 Councillor Chris Vince to Councillor Alastair Gunn (Portfolio Holder for Housing):

Having met with council officers before Christmas I am aware that there is to be a re-tender for fire safety work being done on Morley Grove.

Can I ask that residents of Morley grove are communicated with throughout this tendering process and that all costs involved are explained in detail so there are no surprises when they are re-charged.

Reply from Councillor Alastair Gunn (Portfolio Holder for Housing):

The Council has recently reviewed the way it consults with residents for major works schemes.

Following completion of the initial surveys to identify the work required in relation to the Fire Risk Assessment, a newsletter will be sent to all residents which will include information from the initial surveys.

Section 20 Notices (NOI's) will be issued to leaseholders on completion of the scope of works and estimated costs have been finalised and agreed. This will be the first of two Section 20 Notices issued to leaseholders, in order to inform them of the intent to carry out works.

Supplementary question from Councillor Chris Vince to Councillor Alastair Gunn (Portfolio Holder for Housing):

When it comes to the newsletter that is sent to residents, can I ask that I am sent a copy as well please?

Supplementary reply from Councillor Alastair Gunn (Portfolio Holder for Housing):

I am happy to make that undertaking yes.

2 Councillor James Griggs to Councillor Russell Perrin (Leader of the Council):

At Cabinet on 13th October last year Robert Halfon presented his disability charter. This you enthusiastically accepted with warm words about my response to it and my proposed additions.

You said it would be considered in the next budget round which we will see presented for approval this evening. Would you please update me on progress with the charter and point me to any reference to it in the budget?

Reply from Councillor Russell Perrin (Leader of the Council):

I can provide the following update on the items in Robert Halfon's Disability Charter:

New signage and line painting on Council owned disabled parking spaces: The Council's Environment Team are conducting an audit of all spaces in Council-owned car parks and if any works are required then this will be delivered and funded through existing highways budgets. Additionally, the Council is reviewing the location of disabled parking spaces as part of the regeneration of Playhouse Square under the Levelling Up Fund.

Installation of ANPR cameras for disabled parking spaces: I agree with Cllr Grigg's previous comment that the installation of such cameras, as well as being very costly, would not resolve any problems since Blue Badges are not linked to individual motor vehicles. However, the enforcement of parking in disabled spaces lies within the contract for the North Essex Parking Partnership (NEPP) and we will be asking them to ensure that this is vigorously enforced.

Enforce blocking of dropped kerbs: I am advised that there are limited legal avenues to enforce this. However, I have asked officers to look at rolling out a Communications campaign to highlight the problems that this causes and also target NEPP to focus on any locations that are identified as having a persistent problem.

Ensure signal-controlled crossing points have rotating cones to replicate visual and audible crossing alerts: This is an Essex County Council responsibility and ECC have advised us that "all push buttons now include a tactile rotating cone to assist visual and hearing impaired users".

Ensure tables and chairs are in designated areas: This is managed through our licensing work and is monitored by the Council's Licensing Team with any action taken as appropriate.

Ensure A Boards are in designated areas: This is not covered by licensing regulations but the Council's Regeneration team monitor this in the town centre and speak with retailers and others where any transgressions occur.

Audit of Disabled Toilets on Council premises: A list of all such toilets is currently being compiled and the Council's Property and Facilities team will

undertake an inspection of these, although it is not envisaged that any do not meet the standards required.

Require private landowners to install ANPR on disabled parking spaces and to ensure that their accessible toilets are fully accessible: The Council has no power to require private landowners to do anything in relation to parking spaces or toilet provision. However, in the spirit of Robert Halfon's petition, I have written to more than 30 private landowners urging them to vigorously enforce abuse of disabled parking spaces and to ensure all accessible toilet are properly accessible.

There is no direct reference in the budget to measures to implement elements of the petition because it has been identified that any actions that the Council can take, can all be delivered within existing budgets. None of the items I have listed require an additional budget line.

Supplementary question from Councillor James Griggs to Councillor Russell Perrin (Leader of the Council):

Thank you, I am pleased to hear that there has been some thought given to this important charter. There are a few things there that appear to be within the gift of Essex County Council and as we have discovered earlier on this evening that's not a very productive avenue of exploration on other matters so lets hope that they do better on this one. I also sincerely hope that North Essex Parking Partnership will vigorously pursue their enforcement role as they are not that great in some other areas. There is a lot of use of the word ensure in your answer so can I ask you to please ensure that you adhere to your commitment given in the debate that any engagement will be cross party on any further action on this charter.

Supplementary reply from Councillor Russell Perrin (Leader of the Council):

I am happy to say that following our last meeting where this was raised Councillor Griggs, that I was happy to work cross party on some of the things that you have suggested and any other further suggestions that arise and I am still happy to do that going forward so yes absolutely I undertake that.

3 Councillor James Griggs to Councillor Russell Perrin (Leader of the Council):

As ECC have failed to deliver on your promise of immediate action on 21st January to fix the potholes on First Ave, and your subsequent abandonment of the post of having 'special responsibility for roads' you must have come to the conclusion that ECC are treating your administration with the same contempt they showed for the previous Labour administration.

In the past few days Essex County highways portfolio holder, Cllr Lee Scott, has declined my invitation to visit Harlow to see the extent of the problem.

Will you, therefore, accept my invitation to sign my pothole petition and join councillors and residents on the next public protest event?

Reply from Councillor Russell Perrin (Leader of the Council):

As has already been said tonight the responsibility for repairing and maintaining the majority of the roads on Harlow rests with Essex County Council. I have made no promise that potholes will be fixed, I cannot promise what is not within my power to deliver. However, I have stated publicly Essex County Council's commitment to ensure that safety critical repairs to First Avenue would be made immediately (relative to 21st Jan 2023) weather permitting. I have included here a copy of the press statement which was released to Your Harlow:

"News / Sat 21st Jan 2023 pm31 08:36pm

THE LEADER of Harlow Council has issued a statement regarding the state of First Avenue in Harlow.

Councillor Russell Perrin said: "Since becoming Leader of Harlow Council I have been in regular contact with Essex County Council regarding the state of our roads. It is no secret that our roads are in a poor state. This is not a problem that is confined to Harlow or even Essex this is a nationwide issue.

As many people know, the responsibility for maintaining our roads is not a Harlow Council responsibility but one that rests with Essex County Council. That said I, like everyone who lives and works in Harlow, travel on these roads and as such I want to see them better maintained.

Many will have seen the gradual deterioration of First Avenue. The recent bad weather and snow has made the situation worse. My team and I have been in contact with Essex since the recent thaw of snow to accelerate safety works to this and several other roads. **We received confirmation this week that safety works to First Avenue would take place immediately.** Two thirds of First Avenue safety works have now taken place with the remaining third due to take place this evening (Sat 21st Jan), the rest of the weekend and early next week, weather and temperature conditions permitting.

The only delay to further work taking place will be if we have wet weather or if the temperature drops below 0 degrees as this can cause any repairs to rupture further, making the initial repair pointless."

The Labour Party have protested for many years when they were in administration yielding no discernible improvement in the condition of our roads. We are committed to working with Essex County Council to increasing funding and speeding up repairs So, no I will not sign the petition.

Supplementary question from Councillor James Griggs to Councillor Russell Perrin (Leader of the Council):

Given your clear transference of blame for all of this to Essex County Council its extraordinary that you created a role with special responsibility for roads in this Council, but we will move on from that. We can debate the semantics of when is a promise not a promise. If you issue a statement saying that a repair is going to be immediate I think it is entirely reasonable that the public would see that as...we didn't need to be Mystic Meg on the night of 21 November to realise that it would be zero and wet, it was already close to zero when your statement was issued and subsequent work didn't happen over the next few days when four of the following six days were dry and above zero. So I'm just going to ask you with your thing about protests failing, I mean clearly it doesn't work when you protest, does it, with Essex County Council because you had as much success as we did and you share my frustration at this?

Supplementary reply from Councillor Russell Perrin (Leader of the Council):

Thank you very much. That protest that you referred to there, was not a protest. It was a petition and it was not to get potholes repaired so that's completely different. In terms of transferring the blame, I seek to transfer no blame, merely to state the fact that Essex County Council are the legally responsible authority to deal with roads and, therefore, anything that the council does has to be in a liaison role because we work with the County Council on a vast range of issues, not least the levelling up agenda where hundreds of thousands of pounds flows into this authority for many other things other than just roads. In terms of the Portfolio Holder for roads, the former Portfolio Holder for Roads did an awful lot of work to work with Essex County Council and the team to generate various ideas and to promote the need for further repairs to our roads. It was to give emphasis and to promote the need to get those roads repaired that we had that position. We have heard recently that £9 million extra is going into roads. That is in no large part due to the continual work of people in my Administration and across the district in Essex working with the County Council to highlight this issue. Essex County Council have recognised the issue, recognised the work our County Councillors are doing and are putting the additional funds towards doing that. No protest in the past has ever yielded an extra £9 million in funding for that cause as far as I am aware. It is working in partnership and raising the issue in a calm, considered way that that has been brought about. Also, that calm, considered attitude has now yielded a situation where we are shortly to

announced a match funded scheme where potholes can continued to be repaired at a much faster rate so I much prefer the way that we are doing it because we have got increased funds for the roads above any beyond the initial funding for the roads and we are in the middle or we are about to announce details of a match funded scheme, all of which would never have happened if we had of just shouted and protested like the Labour previous Administration did for a great many number of years.

Minute Item 86b
Recorded Votes on Items 9a-f and 10

Councillor Name	Labour Group Alternative Budget (Amendment)	Conservative Group (Amendment)	Substantive Motion (Resolution)	Council Tax (Resolution)
Councillor David Carter	Absent	Absent	Absent	Absent
Councillor Simon Carter	Against	For	For	For
Councillor Joel Charles	Against	For	For	For
Councillor Nick Churchill	Absent	Absent	Absent	Absent
Councillor Jean Clark	For	For	Against	Abstain
Councillor Bob Davis	Absent	Absent	Absent	Absent
Councillor Jodi Dunne	For	For	Against	Abstain
Councillor Tony Durcan	For	For	Against	Abstain
Councillor Tony Edwards	For	For	Against	Abstain
Councillor Michael Garnett	Against	For	For	For
Councillor James Griggs	For	For	Against	Abstain
Councillor Alastair Gunn	Against	For	For	For
Councillor Michael Hardware	Against	For	For	For
Councillor Andrew Johnson	Abstain	Abstain	Abstain	Abstain
Councillor Eddie Johnson	Absent	Absent	Absent	Absent
Councillor Steve LeMay	Absent	Absent	Absent	Absent
Councillor James Leppard	Against	For	For	For
Councillor Sue Livings	Against	For	For	For
Councillor Ask Malik	Against	For	For	For
Councillor Kay Morrison	For	For	Against	Abstain
Councillor Colleen Morrison	Against	For	For	For
Councillor Russell Perrin	Against	For	For	For
Councillor Daniella Pritchard	For	For	Against	Abstain
Councillor Nicky Purse	Against	For	For	For
Councillor Matthew Saggars	Against	For	For	For
Councillor Clive Souter	Against	For	For	For
Councillor Stacy Seales	Against	For	For	For
Councillor Lanie Shears	For	For	Against	Abstain
Councillor John Strachan	Absent	Absent	Absent	Absent
Councillor Dan Swords	Against	For	For	For
Councillor Chris Vince	For	For	Against	Abstain
Councillor Nancy Watson	Absent	Absent	Absent	Absent
Councillor Mark Wilkinson	For	For	Against	Abstain
	Rejected	Carried	Carried	Carried

Changes highlighted in bold

Nominations for Appointment to Committees, Sub Committees, Panels and Substitutes 2022/23

Audit & Standards Committee (8)	Hearing Sub Committee (6)
Matthew Saggars (c)	Eddie Johnson (c)
Colleen Morrison (vc)	Colleen Morrison (vc)
Simon Carter	Simon Carter
Jean Clark	Jean Clark
Jodi Dunne	Jodi Dunne
Eddie Johnson	Chris Vince
Stacy Seales	Tony Durcan (sub)
Chris Vince	James Leppard (sub)
Tony Durcan (sub)	Matthew Saggars (sub)
Andrew Johnson (sub)	
Ash Malik (sub)	
Scrutiny Committee (8)	Call In Sub Committee
Tony Edwards (c)	The membership of the Call In Sub Committee is to be the same as the Scrutiny Committee
David Carter (vc)	
Nick Churchill	
Ash Malik	
Colleen Morrison	
Kay Morrison	
Matthew Saggars	
Lanie Shears	
Tony Durcan (sub)	
Mike Garnett (sub)	
Sue Livings (sub)	
Clive Souter (sub)	
Mark Wilkinson (sub)	
Licensing Committee (10)	Licensing Sub Committee & Regulatory Sub Committee
Nick Churchill (c)	Licensing Committee & Regulatory Sub Committee members form a pool from which individual Licensing Sub Committees & Regulatory Sub Committees of 3 members are drawn
Clive Souter (vc)	
David Carter	
Joel Charles	
Jodi Dunne	
James Griggs	
Andrew Johnson	
Stacy Seales	
Lanie Shears	
Nancy Watson	

Development Management Committee (8)	
Mike Garnett (c)	
Sue Livings (vc)	
Jean Clark	
Bob Davis	
James Leppard	
Nicky Purse	
Stacy Seales	
Nancy Watson	
Simon Carter (sub)	
Tony Edwards (sub)	
Andrew Johnson (sub)	
Clive Souter (sub)	
Appointments Panel (3)	Civic Awards Panel (4)
Russell Perrin (c)	Andrew Johnson (c)
Dan Swords (vc)	Sue Livings (vc)
Chris Vince	Bob Davis
Tony Edwards (sub)	Matthew Saggars
	Jean Clark (sub)
Chief Executive's Appraisal Panel (3)	Electoral Review Working Group (5)
Russell Perrin (c)	Simon Carter (c)
Joel Charles (vc)	Tony Edwards
Chris Vince	Alastair Gunn
Tony Edwards (sub)	James Leppard
	Chris Vince

Changes highlighted in bold

Member Champions 2022/23

Champion	Nominations
Arts, Culture and Heritage	Sue Livings
IT	Matthew Saggars
Member for the Estates	Colleen Morrison
Mental Health and Wellbeing	Nick Churchill
Roundabouts	Ash Malik
Street Lighting	David Carter

Council Representatives on Outside Bodies 2022/23

Outside Body	Appointments
Active Harlow Partnership	Alastair Gunn
Age Concern	Bob Davis
Citizens Advice Bureau	Bob Davis
District Councils' Network	Russell Perrin Joel Charles (Substitute)
East of England Local Government Association	Russell Perrin Joel Charles (Substitute)
Epping Forest Community Transport	Alastair Gunn
Essex County Council's Essex Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee	David Carter
Essex Police and Crime Panel	Mike Garnett
Fawbert & Barnard Educational Foundation	Sue Livings (12/3/21) Joel Charles (25/5/21) Tom Newens (29/5/21) <i>(Three year terms of office)</i>
Great Parndon Community Association Board	Tony Durcan
Harlow Art Trust	Sue Livings
Harlow Homelessness Prevention Partnership	Lanie Shears
Harlow Occupational Health Service	Tony Edwards
Harlow Recreation Trust Fund – Advisory Panel	<i>Appointed when vacancies arise</i>
Harlow-Stansted Gateway Transportation Board	Michael Hardware
Local Government Association General Assembly	Russell Perrin Joel Charles (Substitute)
Local Government Association District Council's Network Assembly	Russell Perrin Joel Charles (Substitute)
PATROL Adjudication Joint Committee	Tony Durcan

Playhouse Trust	Sue Livings
Safer Harlow Partnership	Ash Malik
St Johns Arts & Recreation Association	Sue Livings
Stansted Airport Consultative Committee	Michael Hardware
Town Centre Partnership	Michael Hardware
Veolia Partnership Board	Alastair Gunn
Waste Member Partnership Board and IAA Member Working Group	Alastair Gunn
Welfare Panel	David Carter Simon Carter Nick Churchill Bob Davis Tony Edwards James Griggs Sue Livings Lanie Shears
Young Concern Trust	Sue Livings
Health & Wellbeing Board	Mike Garnett (Chair)